



REVIEW OF RESEARCH

ISSN: 2249-894X

IMPACT FACTOR : 5.2331(UIF)

VOLUME - 7 | ISSUE - 6 | MARCH - 2018



COMPARATIVE STUDY OF REPORTED SPEECH WITH THE HELP OF TEACHER'S AND LEARNER'S GRAMMAR BOOKS

Gaikwad Ravindra Vilas

Assistant Professor, Dept. of English,

Yashwantrao Chavan Mahavidyalaya, Pachwad, Tal- Wai, Dist- Satara (Maharashtra)

ABSTRACT

A teacher's Grammar contains more information than a learner's grammar. The level of the teacher's knowledge must always be higher than the learners. It will help the learner to solve his/her problems. The learner's grammar is meant to help the learner to learn how to use a language. Generally the knowledge of the learner is less than the teacher so the learner's grammar must be easy to understand. I have choose the grammar topic 'Reported Speech' for the comparison because the use of reported speech is important for good communication skills. Reported speech is the expression of the ideas of others, as well as our own. Reported speech includes some tricky transformations; we will be in a comfortable position to use reported speech in our conversations.



KEYWORDS : *Reported speech, direct speech, indirect speech, free indirect speech, teacher's grammar, learner's grammar.*

INTRODUCTION:

I select, "A University Grammar of English" by Randolph Quirk and Sidney Greenbaum as an example of Teacher's grammar book and "A Practical English Grammar" by A.J. Thomson and A.V. Martinet as an example of learner's grammar. It is interesting to compare the explanation and various rules of transformation of direct and Indirect speech and how it is different for teachers and learners.

In Quirk and Greenbaum's book 'Reported Speech' is the subtopic under the title 'The Complex Sentence'. In "A Practical English Grammar" book reported speech treated as a separate topic because for a learner it is difficult to understand reported speech in terms of its function in the complex sentence.

Comparison of the definitions:

In 'Practical English Grammar' Thomson and Martinet explain the two ways of relating what a person has said i.e. direct and indirect speech. They define direct speech as the "Original speaker's exact words which are placed between punctuation". Indirect speech is the exact meaning of a remark or speech, without necessarily using the speaker's exact words used it in conversation without punctuation.

e.g. He said, 'I have lost my umbrella'. (Direct)

He said that he had lost his umbrella. (Indirect)

Quirk and Greenbaum don't define 'reported speech'. They explain reported speech as the example of the clause. Direct speech is an independent clause or comment clause and indirect speech is that- clause. In Teacher's grammar book reported speech is explained in terms of clauses because it is essential for teacher to

know about clauses and its role in reported speech. This book is slightly difficult for learners because to learn clauses and reported speech at the same time is confusing and difficult for learner.

Comparison between transformation rules of the reported speech:

“A Practical English Grammar” by Thomson and Martinet explains transformation rules. They give importance to tense changes. They explain tense changes rules with the help of following table –

Direct Speech	Indirect Speech
Simple present	Simple past
Present Continuous	Past Continuous
Simple Past	Past Perfect
Present Perfect	Past Perfect
Past Continuous	Past Perfect Continuous
Future (Shall/Will)	Conditional (should/would)

In this learner’s book Thomson and Martinet explain every tense with example and future tense they explain how shall/will changes according to conditional way and the subject (pronoun) used in the sentence.

Quirk and Greenbaum do not mention tense changes directly. They call it as ‘Changes in verb phrase’ or ‘The Rule of Back- Shift’. This rule explains verbs changes in following way-

Direct	Indirect
Present	Past
Past	Past Perfect
Present Perfect	
Past Perfect	

Quirk and Greenbaum do not discuss about all tenses in detail. They don’t mention future tense. Their main focus is on modal auxiliaries. This indicates that Thomson and Martinet explain tense changes in such way that learner can easily use it in communication. On the other hand Quirk and Greenbaum explain about structure of the sentence and how the structure changes when we transform it from direct to indirect.

Comparison between other changes in direct and indirect:

Quirk and Greenbaum point out changes in pronouns. They simply point out the rule that 1st person and 2nd person are changed to 3rd person and words like this, that, here, now are changed as these, those, there and then. They do not explain it but just put a single example of it.

Thomson and Martinet give a detailed note on other changes about pronouns, possessive adjectives, demonstrative adjectives, adverb and adverbial phrases, infinitive and gerund constructions. This explanation and examples are very useful for learner to understand basic information about the transformation changes in reported speech.

Comparison between different types of sentences in reported speech:

Thomson and Martinet explain different types of sentences i.e. question (Wh- questions, Yes/ No type questions, shall/will questions). They explain every type of question and its example. Then they explain indirect commands and its examples. On the other hand Quirk and Greenbaum consider indirect questions and indirect commands are the examples of different clauses. They neither explain these types of sentences in detail nor give various examples. Their explanation is in the following way-

Indirect Question consists with wh or if- clause. And indirect command consist with to- infinitive clause (without subject)

e.g.1 - ‘Are you ready yet?’ asked John. (Yes- No Question)

John asked (me) whether I was ready yet.

e.g.2 - ‘When will the plane leave?’ I wondered. (Wh- question)

I wondered when the plane would leave.

e.g.3 – “Keep still!” she said to the child. (Command)

She told the child to keep still

It is not easy for learners to understand how to transform questions and commands with the help of above example. Quirk and Greenbaum concentrate on how clauses are transformed in the complex sentence and here direct and indirect sentences are the example of complex sentences.

Free Indirect Speech:

Quirk and Greenbaum explain ‘free Indirect Speech’. It is a half way stage between direct and Indirect speech. This form is used in fiction to present stream of thought rather than actual speech.

e.g.- So that was their plan, was it? He will knew their tricks and would show them a thing or two before he was finished.

Thomson and Martinet did not mention free indirect speech because they do not want to confuse new learners with this notion of free indirect speech .Generally free indirect speech is used in narrative writing and no one uses it in communication.

CONCLUSION:

“Practical English Grammar” by Thomson and Martinet illustrate reported speech at the basic level. Every rule and grammar terms are explained with the help of examples. In this Learner’s Grammar book difficult words and complicated grammar terminology is avoided. e.g. (for verb change rule Thomson and Martinet use the term ‘Changes in Tenses’ for learners on the other hand Quirk and Greenbaum use the phrase ‘Back - Shift rule ’which is difficult for learners) Learner’s grammar book is easy to understand direct and indirect speech in communication.

‘A University Grammar of English’ by Quirk and Greenbaum discuss ‘direct- indirect speech’ as a type of complex sentences. They explain how different clauses occur in ‘reported speech’. Basic rules related with reported speech are not mentioned in this book. For new learners Teacher’s grammar book is not easy to improve his/her knowledge and understanding. In this way there are some similarity and differences in the reported speech. Teachers and learners have to decide either they have to fallow r grammar book or Learner’s grammar book according to their need.

REFERENCES:

Quirk Randolph and Greenbaum Sidney, “A University Grammar of English” Pearson publication 2012
Thomson A.J. and Martinet A.V., “A Practical English Grammar”, Oxford University Press 2013



Gaikwad Ravindra Vilas

Assistant Professor, Dept. of English, Yashwantrao Chavan Mahavidyalaya, Pachwad, Tal-Wai, Dist- Satara (Maharashtra)